

15th meeting of the GBEP Task Force on Sustainability

FAO Headquarters, Philippines Room C-277/281

Rome, 29 November 2017

Co-Chairs Conclusions

The GBEP Task Force on Sustainability (TFS) held its 15th meeting on 29 November 2017 at FAO Headquarters in Rome.

Argentina, Brazil, Egypt, Germany, Ghana, Indonesia, Italy, Japan, Paraguay, Spain, United States of America, Vietnam, AFREC, ECOWAS, FAO, IEA, IEA Bioenergy, IRENA and WBCSD participated in the meeting as Partners and Observers.

The 15th meeting of the TFS was preceded by a “Workshop on the Implementation Guide for the GBEP Sustainability Indicators for Bioenergy”.

Workshop on the Implementation Guide for the GBEP Sustainability Indicators for Bioenergy

FAO Headquarters, Philippines Room C-277/281, Rome, 28 November 2017

Mark Davis (Deputy Director a.i., Climate and Environment Division, FAO) opened the workshop and welcomed the participants. Country Representatives to FAO in Rome participated, together with GBEP Partners and Observers, as an opportunity to know more about GBEP and its programme of work. [Maria Michela Morese](#) (GBEP Executive Secretary) then gave a brief overview of the work of GBEP and background to the Implementation Guide for the GBEP Sustainability Indicators (GSIs).

[Miguel Almada](#) (Argentina) and [Kwabena Ampadu Otu-Danquah](#) (Ghana) provided experiences on the implementation of the GSIs in their respective countries. Mr. Almada gave details of the implementation of the GSIs in Argentina, which focused on two biofuel production chains – biodiesel from soybean and ethanol from sugar cane. The project shows that biofuels have an increasing role in the Argentine production chains and the country’s energy matrix. The measurement of the GSIs has set a benchmark to track progress in the sector and provide an important tool for policy making. Mr. Kwabena Ampadu Otu-Danquah presented Ghana’s experience on the measurement of the GSIs. This pilot project aimed to assess the status of bioenergy data collection in Ghana and to understand the practicalities of implementing the GSIs in the country. The results of the pilot provided insights into the status of bioenergy data collection in Ghana and showed that increased financial resources are needed for improved data availability and quality. From this experience, they see the Implementation Guide as an extremely useful resource, and that providing a stepwise approach that starts with a selection of simplified indicators would be beneficial.

[Bah Saho](#) (ECREEE/ECOWAS) provided background on the ECOWAS region and the foundation of ECREEE. He then gave an overview of the ECOWAS Bioenergy Policy, whose development was promoted through Activity Group 1 (“Promoting Sustainable Modern Bioenergy in West Africa”) of the GBEP Working Group on Capacity Building (WGCB). Feedback from Member States shows that the work with GBEP has raised awareness and

increased knowledge of bioenergy, and has helped to develop capacities. [Simone Landolina](#) (IEA) also gave a presentation on the IEA Roadmap released in November 2017. He showed that sustainable bioenergy is an indispensable component of the necessary portfolio of low-C technologies in climate change mitigation scenarios and that GBEP's Sustainability Indicators for Bioenergy can play a key role to help develop sustainable supply chains and implement appropriate sustainability governance.

The added value of the influence of the GBEP indicators on the national and regional policies, as well as on the IEA Roadmap development were highlighted by the speakers and particularly appreciated by the participants.

[Uwe Fritsche](#) (Germany) presented the Technical Paper on the “Linkages between the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) and the GBEP Sustainability Indicators for Bioenergy (GSIs)”. The paper provides a mapping of the indicators for both the GBEP Indicators and the SDGs, and includes information on the ‘tier’ of these indicators under the SDG system. This work shows that 23 out of 24 of the GSIs are directly linked to SDGs, their targets and/or the relevant indicators. It can also be seen that many of the SDG indicators are currently at tier III stage, meaning that the methodology has not yet been defined and data is not available. It was concluded that the GSI Implementation Guide should take up the information on SDG linkages, based on the technical paper. It was also deemed important to integrate the Technical Paper and the GSI work with national entities who are implementing the SDGs (through the commitment of the GBEP Partners and Observers) and also with supranational institutions who coordinate SDG progress. Even though the Technical Paper is finalised, further inputs from Partners and Observers are welcome by 19 January 2018.

A first draft of the Technical Report on the “Attribution of impacts to bioenergy production and use for the implementation of the GBEP GSIs” was also presented during the workshop. Input was provided by [Alessandro Agostini](#) (ENEA, Italy) on various methods of attribution (or allocation) in Life Cycle Analysis (LCA) and how attribution has been dealt with by other international institutions. [Jürgen Giegrich](#) (IFEU) then provided an overview of the specific approach of the technical report on dealing with the attribution issue in relation to bioenergy and the GSIs, which is based on the lessons learned from implementation of the GSIs in Colombia, Indonesia and Germany. For the GSIs, three types of attribution issues have been identified: interpreting or generating statistical data; co-production of bioenergy and other products; and a combination of both. Inputs were provided during the lively discussion on the technical report and further inputs are requested from Partners and Observers by 19 January 2018 so that they can be reflected in the report in order to have a webinar early 2018 (or an event, back-to-back, to the 2018 Bioenergy Week, if possible) to discuss the revised document.

Two further additional tools for the development of the Implementation Guide were presented at the workshop. The first was given by [Jeff Arnold](#) (ARS, USDA) on the Soil and Water Assessment Tool (SWAT), which can be used to model watersheds for numerous applications. Mr. Arnold gave an overview of the model and the scales at which it can be used, which ranges from small, local scale up to a global model, and how it can be used to determine national food supplies, water use/efficiency and soil erosion. He also provided information on publications and support related to the model, and expressed the availability for group training, if desired.

[Horst Fehrenbach](#) (Germany) also provided an overview of the methodology and tool for GBEP indicators 1 and 4 developed by IFEU, and its application in Viet Nam and Paraguay. The tool uses a LCA approach to determine greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions and non-GHG air pollutants from bioenergy production and use. He detailed the principles of the tool and how allocation is dealt with within the LCA. So far, the tool has been used in the implementation of the GSIs in Viet Nam and Paraguay, and will soon be applied in Ethiopia and Kenya; there is

also the possibility to derive a generic tool, although tailoring would always have to occur on the ground to fit with country context.

Task Force on Sustainability

The Co-Chair of the Task Force on Sustainability, Mr. Kwabena Ampadu Otu-Danquah from Ghana, welcomed participants and officially adopted the meeting's [agenda](#). Given that Mr. Sven-Olov Ericson from Sweden retired from his position as Co-chair earlier in 2017, three new supporting Co-chairs have been chosen during this transition period – Mr. Takashi Hayashi (Japan), Ms. Annalisa Zezza (Italy) and Mr. Ahmed Abdelati Ahmed (Egypt).

Enhancing the practicality of the GSIs

[Constance Miller](#) presented the GBEP Secretariat work to date on the 'Stepwise Approach' to measurement of the GBEP indicators to enhance the practicality of the indicators. This approach is to be included in the Implementation Guide. During discussions, it was agreed to introduce a chart summarizing the steps, as well as a 'Step 0' to the approach, which helps countries to self-assess the national situation, define modern bioenergy, and determine system boundaries for the measurement. Inputs on this document are requested from Partners and Observers by 19 January 2018.

Further to the stepwise approach, it was agreed that the Implementation Guide would benefit from a flowchart representing the indicators and their links to required data. Germany kindly proposed to develop a draft of this flowchart by the end of March 2018.

As another way to enhance the practicality of the indicators, the option to utilise the GBEP website as a data repository for international databases was discussed. If the website included links to databases where global data was available, this may reduce the effort required to collect data where national statistics are not available. The AFREC Bioenergy Database, as presented by [Atef Marzouk](#) (AFREC) during the meeting, could represent a potentially relevant regional database to be included. Partners and Observers are requested to provide links to relevant international databases to begin compiling this repository by March 2018.

Continuing the discussion on data availability and practicality of the indicators, the Partners and Observers considered the idea of developing an excel-based tool or tools to aid the implementation of the indicators, and to make regular monitoring more feasible. This was based on the presentation by [Marco Colangeli](#) (FAO) of a Horizon 2020 project (FORBIO) where FAO has developed an automated tool for measuring the indicators in a specific context. It was agreed that this could be useful to develop but that making it applicable to all global contexts would be a challenge.

Cross-cutting issues for the implementation of the GSIs

As part of the discussion, the remaining cross-cutting issues that had not yet been fully addressed were discussed. Proxies and best practices were deliberated on and it was agreed that it would be useful to provide guidance on the use of best practices and the various approaches that can be taken. As such, the GBEP Secretariat will work together with the kind support of IRENA to prepare an information document that could eventually be integrated into the Implementation Guide. Relevant studies to be included in this document are requested from Partners and Observers by 19 January 2018.

Status of the discussion under the sub-groups of the Task Force on Sustainability

The work conducted under the three ([Environmental](#), [Social](#) and [Economic](#)) sub-groups of the TFS during 2017 was presented and remaining guidance to be provided was discussed. A provisional timeline for all three sub-groups was then agreed by Partners and Observers: all inputs on the 2017 reports from the three sub-groups are requested from Partners and Observers by 19 January 2018; in early 2018, additional virtual meetings will take place to resolve open issues; in April/May 2018, draft sections of the Implementation Guide for each sub-group will be presented; cross-cutting issues relevant for the three sub-groups and the draft sections of the Implementation Guide will be discussed, both virtually and potentially during a side-event at the 2018 Bioenergy Week, in June 2018; and in July/August 2018, final drafts will be circulated for discussion at the GBEP meetings in November 2018, with a view to include them in the Implementation Guide.

Conclusions and next steps

- **Technical Report on Attribution** – inputs are requested by 19 January 2018 and a webinar is to be held early 2018 (or an event organised back-to-back to the 2018 Bioenergy Week, if possible) to discuss the revised document based on these inputs.
- **Technical Paper on linkages between SDGs and GSIs** – inputs are welcomed by 19 January 2018 in order to definitively finalise the document and integrate it into the Implementation Guide.

The next step is to solidify these identified linkages by integrating the Technical Paper and work on the GSIs with national entities who are implementing the SDGs at country level and to raise awareness among supranational institutions.

- **Stepwise Approach** – Inputs are requested by 19 January 2018.
A ‘Step 0’ will be developed to guide practitioners in preparation for implementation of the GSIs, including self-assessment of national situation, definition of modern bioenergy, and determination of system boundaries.
Germany has kindly agreed to develop a ‘flowchart’ of how the indicators are interlinked and the most efficient order of measurement, to be prepared by end of March 2018.
- **Data collection repository** – inputs on relevant international/regional databases to compile an online repository are requested from Partners and Observers by March 2018.
- **Proxies and best practices** – the GBEP Secretariat, with kind support from IRENA, will develop an information document on the use of proxies and best practices. Relevant studies to be included in this document are requested by 19 January 2018.
- **Timeline for the three sub-groups of TFS** –
 - 19 January 2018 – All inputs from Partners and Observers on the 2017 sub-group reports are requested
 - Early 2018 – Additional virtual meetings held to resolve open issues
 - April/May 2018 – Draft sections of the Implementation Guide for each sub-group drafted
 - June 2018 – Teleconferences, or potentially a side-event at the 2018 Bioenergy Week, held to discuss drafts
 - July/August 2018 – Final drafts prepared and circulated to Partners and Observers for discussion at the GBEP meetings (November 2018).